

# Notice of Allowability

Application No.

09/743,288

Examiner

Taylor Victor Oh

Applicant(s)

CARENCOTTE ET AL.

Art Unit

1625

## -- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address--

All claims being allowable, PROSECUTION ON THE MERITS IS (OR REMAINS) CLOSED in this application. If not included herewith (or previously mailed), a Notice of Allowance (PTOL-85) or other appropriate communication will be mailed in due course. **THIS NOTICE OF ALLOWABILITY IS NOT A GRANT OF PATENT RIGHTS.** This application is subject to withdrawal from issue at the initiative of the Office or upon petition by the applicant. See 37 CFR 1.313 and MPEP 1308.

1. ☒ This communication is responsive to 12/1/2003.
2. ☒ The allowed claim(s) is/are 54-76.
3. ☒ The drawings filed on 08 January 2001 are accepted by the Examiner.
4. ☒ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
  - a) ☒ All b) ☐ Some\* c) ☐ None of the:
    1. ☒ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
    2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
    3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this national stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).
  - \* Certified copies not received: \_\_\_\_\_.
5. ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(e) (to a provisional application) since a specific reference was included in the first sentence of the specification or in an Application Data Sheet. 37 CFR 1.78.
  - (a) ☐ The translation of the foreign language provisional application has been received.
6. ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for domestic priority under 35 U.S.C. §§ 120 and/or 121 since a specific reference was included in the first sentence of the specification or in an Application Data Sheet. 37 CFR 1.78.

Applicant has THREE MONTHS FROM THE "MAILING DATE" of this communication to file a reply complying with the requirements noted below. Failure to timely comply will result in ABANDONMENT of this application. **THIS THREE-MONTH PERIOD IS NOT EXTENDABLE.**

7. ☐ A SUBSTITUTE OATH OR DECLARATION must be submitted. Note the attached EXAMINER'S AMENDMENT or NOTICE OF INFORMAL PATENT APPLICATION (PTO-152) which gives reason(s) why the oath or declaration is deficient.
8. ☐ CORRECTED DRAWINGS (as "replacement sheets") must be submitted.
  - (a) ☐ including changes required by the Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948) attached
    - 1) ☐ hereto or 2) ☐ to Paper No. \_\_\_\_\_.
  - (b) ☐ including changes required by the proposed drawing correction filed \_\_\_\_\_, which has been approved by the Examiner.
  - (c) ☐ including changes required by the attached Examiner's Amendment / Comment or in the Office action of Paper No. \_\_\_\_\_.

Identifying indicia such as the application number (see 37 CFR 1.84(c)) should be written on the drawings in the front (not the back) of each sheet. Replacement sheet(s) should be labeled as such in the margin according to 37 CFR 1.121(d).

9. ☐ DEPOSIT OF and/or INFORMATION about the deposit of BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL must be submitted. Note the attached Examiner's comment regarding REQUIREMENT FOR THE DEPOSIT OF BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL.

### Attachment(s)

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| 1 <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)  | 5 <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)          |
| 2 <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)                    | 6 <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413), Paper No. _____             |
| 3 <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statements (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08), Paper No. _____  | 7 <input type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Amendment/Comment                             |
| 4 <input type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Comment Regarding Requirement for Deposit of Biological Material | 8 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Statement of Reasons for Allowance |
|  | 9 <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____  |

**Reasons for Allowance**

The following is an examiner's statement of reasons for allowance:

the close references for the current invention are Ruest et al (U.S. 4,524,077) , Grendel et al (U.S. 5,498,790) , and Kawabe et al (U.S. 5,763,652).

Ruest et al teach the process of preparing 2-hydroxy-4-methylthiobutyric acid (HMBA) in which 2-hydroxy-4-methylthiobutyronitrile (HMBN) is hydrolyzed with sulfuric acid to produce an aqueous hydrolyzate containing HMBA and some amide , which is further treated with methyl ethyl ketone, methyl isobutyl ketone in a liquid-liquid extraction system to produce an extract containing HMBA, thereby recovering the HMBA . Grendel et al teach the process of regenerating a sulfuric acid to be used for hydrolysis of HMBN in the preparation of HMBA. Furthermore, Kawabe et al does teach the process of producing 2-hydroxy-4-methylthiobutyric acid (HMBA) from a starting material of 2-hydroxy-4-methylthiobutyronitrile (HMBN) in various steps of : hydration, hydrolysis, a recycling of ammonia, and electro dialysis .

However, the instant invention differs from the prior art in that none of the cited references teach the claimed method wherein neutralized hydrolysate is not separated into an aqueous phase and an organic phase before the extraction step. In addition, unless all limitations of the claims are met, there is no prior art rejection. See In re Zurko 59 USPQ 2d 1690 (Fed Cir. 1991) and In re Lee, 61 USPQ 1430 (Fed Cir. 1991). In the industrial process, the aforementioned process is important.

Therefore, applicants' claimed subject matter would not have been obvious to the person with an ordinary skill in the art.

Art Unit: 1625

Any comments considered necessary by applicant must be submitted no later than the payment of the issue fee and, to avoid processing delays, should preferably accompany the issue fee. Such submissions should be clearly labeled "Comments on Statement of Reasons for Allowance."

*Margaret Seaman*  
*12/23/03*

*Margaret Seaman*  
**D. MARGARET SEAMAN**  
**PRIMARY EXAMINER**